Appendix 1

SUMMARY OF DECISIONS REQUESTED

in submissions and further submissions (BY PROVISION)

on

Proposed Plan Change 3B (Pomahaka catchment minimum flow)

to the Regional Plan: Water for Otago

Appendix 1 to Officers' Report



Preface

Proposed Plan Change 3B (Pomahaka catchment minimum flow) to the Regional Plan: Water for Otago was publicly notified on Saturday 16 August 2014 in accordance with Clause 5 of the First Schedule of the Resource Management Act 1991 (RMA).

These changes seek to set a primary allocation limit and minimum flow for the Pomahaka catchment, along with a supplementary minimum flow to manage future allocation. An alluvial ribbon aquifer for the catchment is proposed and its groundwater will be managed as surface water.

The Otago Regional Council received a total of 17 submissions on the Proposed Plan Change from a range of groups, organisations and individuals. 16 of these submissions were lodged within the statutory time frame specified, by 5pm on Friday 12 September 2014. One submission was received late and is marked accordingly.

This document summarises the 17 submissions received, ordered by Plan provision.

To view the submissions grouped by individual Submitter, see the Summary of Decisions Requested by Submissions notified on 27 September 2014 in accordance with Clause 7 of the First Schedule of the RMA.

Matters beyond the scope of the plan change are presented at the end of this document.

Any associated further submission in support or opposition is included following its submission point. These are shown in *italics*. A total of 2 further submissions were received by the closing date of Friday 10 October 2014.

The full original submissions are available at Otago Regional Council offices and on www.orc.govt.nz, under Home>Publications and reports>Regional policies, plans, strategies and bylaws>Regional Plan: Water>Proposed Plan Change 3B (Pomahaka catchment minimum flow)>View the submissions.

Alternatively, this is

http://www.orc.govt.nz/Documents/Publications/Regional/Water/3B/the%20submissions.pdf

Index to Submitters – By Name or Organisation

Surname, First Name or Organisation	Address for Service	Submitter
Barrett, Mark	66 F Grove St	Number 16
Danen, Mark	St Kilda	10
	Dunedin 9012	
Breeze, Ian, Otago Flyfishers and	8 Uxbridge St	1
Streambashers	Dunedin 9010	1
Clutha District Council	Peter Ross	17
Ciutia District Council	PO Box 25	(Late)
	Balclutha 9240	(Late)
Cravens, Casey, Wild Angler	70 Passmore Crescent	10
Cravens, Casey, what might	Maori Hill	10
	Dunedin 9010	
Conservation, Director General of	Herb Familton	9
Conscivation, Director General of	South Island RMA Planning	
	Department of Conservation	
	Private Bag 4715	
	Christchurch 8140	
Federated Farmers NZ (Inc)	Kim Reilly	7
redefated raimers 142 (me)	PO Box 5242	,
	Dunedin 9054	
Kai Tahu ki Otago	Tim Vial, Senior Planner	14
Tunu ki Otugo	PO Box 446	17
	Dunedin 9054	
McIntyre, Adrian	240 McIntyre Road	8
Wentyre, ranan	Gore RD5 9775	
McIntyre, Alan	683 Aramoana Road	12
Wienityre, rhan	Aramoana Aramoana	12
	Dunedin 9082	
McManus, Gordon	90A Carroll Street	13
Wichianas, Gordon	Dunedin	
Neilson, Murray	22 Berwick Road	6
Ttonson, Trairay	Woodside RD 1	
	Outram 9073	
Otago Anglers' Association	Chris Fahey, President	15
ougo i ingreio i issociation	328A Tomahawk Road	
	Ocean Grove	
	Dunedin 9013	
Otago Fish and Game Council	Peter Wilson, Environmental Officer	4
ougo i isii unu cumo counti	PO Box 76	
	Dunedin 9054	
Rietveld, Daniel	120 Main Rd	11
	Fairfield	
	Dunedin 9018	
Turner, Brian	3363 Ida Valley – Omakau Road	3
	Oturehua 9387	
Weddel, Mike	1 Haggart St	5
	Wingatui RD2	
	Mosgiel	
Wyatt, Robert	15 Seaview Road	2
, 2.00022	Brighton	
	Dunedin	

Index to Submitters – By Submitter Number

Carlo ac : 44 -	Summaria First Name or	
	Surname, First Name or	Address for Service
Number	Organisation	0.11.11.00
1	Breeze, Ian, Otago Flyfishers and Streambashers	8 Uxbridge St
		Dunedin 9010
2	Wyatt, Robert	15 Seaview Road
		Brighton
		Dunedin
3	Turner, Brian	3363 Ida Valley – Omakau Road
		Oturehua 9387
4	Otago Fish and Game Council	Peter Wilson,
		Environmental Officer
		PO Box 76
		Dunedin 9054
5	Weddel, Mike	1 Haggart St
		Wingatui RD2
		Mosgiel
6	Neilson, Murray	22 Berwick Road
		Woodside RD 1
		Outram 9073
7	Federated Farmers NZ (Inc)	Kim Reilly
		PO Box 5242
		Dunedin 9054
8	McIntyre, Adrian	240 McIntyre Road
		Gore RD5 9775
9	Conservation, Director General of	Herb Familton
		South Island RMA Planning,
		Department of Conservation
		Private Bag 4715
		Christchurch 8140
10	Cravens, Casey, Wild Angler	70 Passmore Crescent
	, ,,	Maori Hill
		Dunedin 9010
11	Rietveld, Daniel	120 Main Rd
		Fairfield
		Dunedin 9018
12	McIntyre, Alan	683 Aramoana Road
		Aramoana
		Dunedin 9082
13	McManus, Gordon	90A Carroll Street,
	The state of the s	Dunedin
14	Kai Tahu ki Otago	Tim Vial, Senior Planner
1.	Tuna in Otago	PO Box 446
		Dunedin 9054
15	Otago Anglers' Association	Chris Fahey, President,
	Compo i ingress i noscention	328A Tomahawk Road
		Ocean Grove
		Dunedin 9013
16	Barrett, Mark	66 F Grove St
10	Dairon, Mark	St Kilda
		Dunedin 9012
17	Clutha District Council	Peter Ross
(Late)	Cidula District Council	PO Box 25
(Late)		Balclutha 9240
		DalCiulia 7440

Index to Further Submitters

Organisation	Contact	Address1	Town	Post	F Sub
Name	(for Service)			Code	#
Federated Farmers	Kim Reilly	PO Box 5242	Dunedin	9054	21
Otago Fish and Game Council	Peter Wilson, Environmental Officer	PO Box 76	Dunedin	9054	22

Index to Reference numbers & pages: Plan Provisions submitted on

Plan Provision	Provision Code	Page of this
	Reference number	document
Policy 6.4.5(b) + Rule 12.1.4.2	1	8
Maps B11,13,15	2	10
Schedule 2A, Irrigation season minimum flow of 3600 l/s	4	12
Schedule 2A, May-Sept minimum flow of 7000 l/s	5	18
All schedule dates	17	19
Schedule 2A, Primary Allocation Limit	6	19
Schedule 2B, Supplementary minimum flow (first block)	7	20
Schedule 2B, Supplementary block size	9	21
Schedule 2C, Provision of an alluvial ribbon aquifer	10	22
Maps B & C	13	23
Whole plan change	14	23
Minor & consequential	18	26
Section 32 Evaluation Report	15	26

Matters beyond the scope of the plan change	16	41

Grouped by Provision(Matters within the scope of the plan change)

1 Policy 6.4.5(b) + Rule 12.1.4.2

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Name/Further	F Sub			
Submitter Name	#			
Brian Turner	3	Support	Approve the plan change as advertised.	 Submitter considers both the Pomahaka and the Waipahi Rivers deserve the highest level of protection through the water plan, providing for a healthy river ecosystem and a productive trout fishery. Reasons for serious environmental pollution and degradation include ignorance, wilful blindness, and efforts to optimise individual material wealth at the expense of nature and the common good of the whole of human society. There is not a river or stream that is in as healthy a condition today as it was when submitter began fishing in the rivers and seas of Otago and further afield in the mid-1950s. The Pomahaka and Waipahi were among favourites. On warm days in the 1950s submitter recalls drinking from ripples in parts of the middle reaches of the Pomahaka. Deterioration, one way or another, has been the reality. We continue to witness the intensification of industrial and agricultural activity resulting in the drawing off of increasing amounts of water, all of which has upped the levels of pollution. The ORC must ensure such is stopped.
Otago Fish & Game	22	Support		Submitter accurately reflects effects of unconstrained land use
Council		submission		and water allocation, which proposed plan change, and plan
		3 ref. 1		change 6A should rectify.
Otago Fish and Game Council	4	Support	Retain notified version.	 The submitter wishes to support the proposed summer minimum flow of 3600 l/s, the winter minimum flow of 7000 l/s, the supplementary minimum flow of 13000 l/s and the 500 l/s allocation blocks; also strongly supports the proposed primary allocation limit of 1000 l/s. The Pomahaka River and its tributaries, particularly the Waipahi River have a range of very high fishery and amenity values and there is popular support within the local

Submitter Name/Further Submitter Name	Sub/ F Sub #	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
				 community and within the wider Otago community for a minimum flow that reflects those values and allows them to flourish. The Pomahaka catchment waters provide important trout spawning and rearing facilities for the lower Clutha trout fishery. The river has further potential to provide for sea run salmon spawning, rearing and recruitment and to play an important role in the restoration of a meaningful salmon run in the Lower Clutha. Land use intensification over the last 15 years is considered to have impacted on fishery values but it is hoped that the setting of a minimum flow in conjunction with the implementation of plan change 6A will see the river protected and returned to the best possible condition. This recent run on the water resource and the issuing of 35 year consents does pose some issues for the ORC in establishing the primary allocation limit of 1000 l/s, as this has already been exceeded. There is therefore some urgency in this plan change.
Mike Weddell	5	Support	Retain notified version.	 It is pleasing to see that the ORC is moving to notify a plan change for the river and to place a minimum flow and allocation limits on the water resource. The Pomahaka and the Waipahi combined are an important part of Otago's trout fishery which is a dwindling resource. Submitter hopes with the implementation of PC 6A and the setting of a sensible minimum flow that both of these rivers can be protected and returned to the best possible condition.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 5 ref. 1		Same position as further submitter.

Submitter Name/Further Submitter Name	Sub/ F Sub #	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Conservation, Director General of	9	Support	Retain addition of word "Pomahaka" to policy and rule.	 Inclusion of the Pomahaka gives effect to Part II RMA, NPS Freshwater and Otago RPS, policy 7(a) and 7(d) of the Conservation General Policy (2005) and to the Southland CMS. The Policy enables a RMA provision link to give effect to and implement Water Plan Chapter 12 rules on Water Take, Use and Management under S67(1) RMA.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 9 ref. 1		Inclusion of the word "Pomahaka" in this policy and this rule provides greater clarity.
Kai Tahu ki Otago	14	Support	Adopt the proposed primary allocation limit and minimum flow for the Pomahaka catchment, along with a supplementary minimum flow to manage future allocation.	 The proposed summer minimum flow and the primary allocation limit are consistent with the Proposed National Environmental Standard on Ecological Flows and Water Levels, which sets appropriate baseline benchmarks for assessing the minimum flow and primary allocation regime for the Pomahaka River. The proposed minimum flow regime supports a strong continuity and variability of flow from the headwaters of the Pomahaka River to the confluence with the Clutha/Mata-au. The proposed plan change provides for in-stream habitat and for the wider needs of mahika kai, taoka species and other species of importance to Kai Tahu ki Otago.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 14 ref. 1		Same position as further submitter.

2 Maps B11,13,15

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Name/Further	F Sub			
Submitter Name	#			
Otago Fish and	4	Amend	Change Pomahaka catchment to	This is necessary to more accurately reflect the boundary

Submitter Name/Further Submitter Name	Sub/ F Sub #	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Game Council			"Pomahaka catchment within Otago" to better reflect the boundaries.	between Otago and Southland that does not include all of the Waipahi catchment headwater streams. • The plan change defines the Pomahaka catchment in maps B11, B13, and B15, which will be added to the Regional Plan: Water. However, some of the Waipahi catchment, and thus, the Pomahaka catchment by extension is in the Southland region as the regional council boundary follows the true left of the Waipahi River closely, which excludes quite a large area of the catchment and tributary streams such as the Kaiwera on to the true left of the river between a point about 6 kilometres upstream of SH1 and the point where the Waipahi crosses the Old Coach Road (SH 93). It is not clear if the minimum flow at Burkes Ford can affect water allocation in these streams, and this poses some risk to the effectiveness of the minimum flow in that different allocation regimes might be operating on the tributary streams to that operating on the main stem.
Conservation, Director General of Otago Fish & Game	9	Amend Support	Clarify that the catchment refers to "the Pomahaka catchment within the Otago Regional Council jurisdiction". Clarify how the plan regime will apply to the Waipahi River.	 The jurisdiction is just for the Pomahaka catchment within the Otago region and does not include some of the Waipahi headwater streams in Southland region. It is not clear how the plan regime will apply to the Waipahi River. The issue of jurisdiction and boundaries needs to be clarified.
Council		submission 9 ref. 2		
Conservation, Director General of	9	Amend	Clarify the application of the Pomahaka minimum flow and allocation limits on the section of the Waipahi River that lie within Otago region before it flows into the	 The jurisdiction is just for the Pomahaka catchment within the Otago region and does not include some of the Waipahi headwater streams in Southland region. It is not clear how the plan regime will apply to the Waipahi River.

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Name/Further	F Sub			
Submitter Name	#			
			Pomahaka. Submitter assumes a	
			minimum flow of at least 84% of the	
			Waipahi River 7-Day MALF at the	
			confluence of the Waipahi with the	
			Pomahaka River, and any associated	
			consequential amendment to any	
			relevant minimum and allocation	
			limit rules, maps and schedules.	
Federated Farmers	21	Oppose		Submitter sought a minimum flow of at least 84% of the
		submission		Waipahi River 7-Day MALF at the confluence of the Waipahi
		9 ref. 2		with the Pomahaka River. Any such determinations must
				undergo a thorough community consultation process so that
				those directly affected by such decisions have the ability to have
				input into these matters

4 Schedule 2A, Irrigation season minimum flow of 3600 l/s

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Name/Further	F Sub			
Submitter Name	#			
Ian Breeze	1	Support	The minimum flow on the Pomahaka at Burkes Ford should be no less than 3600 litres/sec.	• The submitter would like to protect rivers against excessive abstraction. Water abstraction allows intensification of agriculture with increased greenhouse gas emissions.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 1 ref. 4		Same position as further submitter.
Robert Wyatt	2	Support	Maintain the current minimum flow for the Pomahaka catchment.	• It is a highly valued trophy trout fishery that depends upon a significant flow during low water periods to avoid excessive water temperatures and depleted oxygen levels in the lower reaches. This includes the already much deteriorated Waipahi River, which has suffered greatly from increased algae growth from high levels of nutrients due to farming.

Submitter Name/Further Submitter Name	Sub/ F Sub #	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 2 ref. 4		Same position as further submitter.
Otago Fish and Game Council	4	Oppose	Otago Fish and Game submit in support of a minimum flow proposal of 3800 litres per second.	 The submitter supports the plan change but there appears to be a strong case for a higher summer minimum flow of 3800 l/s based on the river's diverse values and community support. The upper tributaries provide for a regionally significant recreational fishery (trophy fishing of brown trout) and a regionally significant fish habitat (brown trout spawning and rearing). The Pomahaka River from Switzers Bridge to its confluence with the Clutha River provides for a regionally significant recreational fishery (brown trout). The Waipahi River provides for a regionally significant recreational fishery (brown trout fly fishing). The proposed summer minimum flow of 3600 litres per second provides 99% surety of supply for irrigators, whilst only providing for 84% of MALF for the river. This is not a water short area and nor does it have a history of overallocation. A fairer balance of risk between the health of the river and out of stream uses can be achieved with a summer minimum flow of 3800 litres per second.
Federated Farmers	21	Oppose in part submission 4 ref. 4		Submitter sought a higher summer minimum flow of 3800 l/s based on the river's diverse values and community support particularly in relation to trout fishing. Submitter considers that the proposed summer minimum flow of 3600 litres per second provides 99% surety of supply for irrigators, whilst only providing for 84% of MALF for the river. This is not a water short area and nor does it have a history of over-allocation. A fairer balance of risk between the health of the river and out of

Submitter Name/Further Submitter Name	Sub/ F Sub #	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Mike Weddell	5	Oppose	Submitter supports a minimum flow proposal of 3800 litres per second.	stream uses can be achieved with a summer minimum flow of 3800 litres per second. The ORC science team have carried out substantial work to reach the figure of 3,600 litres per second and this has been put to the community as part of multiple workshop discussions. We have concerns that a higher figure has not been adequately discussed at community level. • The upper tributaries provide for a regionally significant recreational fishery (trophy fishing of brown trout) and a
				 regionally significant fish habitat (brown trout spawning and rearing). The Pomahaka River from Switzers Bridge to its confluence with the Clutha River provides for a regionally significant recreational fishery (brown trout). The Waipahi River provides for a regionally significant recreational fishery (brown trout fly fishing). The proposed summer minimum flow of 3600 litres per second provides 99% surety of supply for irrigators, whilst only providing for 84% of MALF for the river. This is not a water short area and nor does it have a history of overallocation. A fairer balance of risk between the health of the river and out of stream uses can be achieved with a summer minimum flow of 3800 litres per second.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 5 ref. 4		A slightly higher minimum flow of 3800 l/s is same position as further submitter.
Murray Neilson	6	Amend	Amend proposed October - April minimum flow from 3,600 l/s to 3,800 l/s (90% MALF).	 The current allocation from the catchment is approximately 30% of MALF with further new applications made occasionally. Jowett and Hayes (2004) recommend that for rivers with

Submitter Name/Further Submitter Name	Sub/ F Sub #	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
				greater than 30% of MALF allocated more in depth consideration is needed for the minimum flow. There is low demand for irrigation water in the catchment. There is a regionally significant presence of trout in the catchment and its Waipahi tributary, the only catchments identified for this value in the Water Plan - they are therefore unique in Otago. Adult brown trout fishery values were considered the highest significance of all the values recognised by the community, in the series of workshops held by the ORC. Jowett (2009) stated that provided flows are always more than 90% of MALF adult brown trout will be sustained and thus it is expected that the adult trout fishery will be maintained, in rivers where the optimum flow and flow at which habitat declines sharply for adult trout are higher than MALF. An amended October-April minimum flow of 3,800 l/s would better provide for the fishery, while still allowing for and not unduly affecting out-of-stream uses of water.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 6 ref. 4		Supports request for minimum flow of 3,800 l/s
Adrian McIntyre	8	Amend	Submitter wants the Otago Regional Council to approve the plan change as advertised or alternatively to approve the allocation limits and winter minimum flow and increase the summer minimum flow to 90% of the mean annual low flow (3.9 cumecs).	I would like to see ORC put in place a generous minimum flow regime which recognises the place of both rivers at the heart of West Otago so that it continues to provide enjoyment to present and future generations.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission		A higher minimum flow of 3900 l/s closely matches position of further submitter, and is consistent with the high value and

Submitter Name/Further Submitter Name	Sub/ F Sub #	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
		8 ref. 4		regionally significant trout fishery present.
Conservation, Director General of	9	Support	Retain.	 Inclusion of the specified minimum flows and allocations give effect to Part II RMA, NPS Freshwater and Otago RPS, policy 7(a) and 7(d) of the Conservation General Policy (2005) and to the Southland CMS. The minimum flows give a very high degree of reliability of supply. These minimum flows and allocations will safeguard the life-supporting capacity of the Pomahaka's aquatic resources and sustain the Pomahaka's freshwater fishery values.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 9 ref. 4		Submitter has stated desire for a higher minimum flow of 3,800 l/s, however.
Casey Cravens (Wild Angler)	10	Support	Submitter supports the ORC's desire to set minimum flows of at least 3.6 in the summer, but thinks there's a valid argument to raise minimum summer flows to five cumecs.	 The Pomahaka is a uniquely beautiful and valuable natural resource, one of the best rivers in the country - and world. Its large resident trout and magnificent sea-run browns attract local and international anglers. It hosts a salmon run which is especially significant since the Pomahaka offers the best spawning areas after the Clyde Dam reduced the Clutha population from 30,000 fish to 500. In the headwaters the river is clear enough to sight fish, which is the pinnacle of the New Zealand fly fishing experience. Submitter is a fly fishing guide submitter and knows what appeals to international travellers. This iconic river has been the subject of several widely viewed videos and photographs that help make the New Zealand brand what it is. The watershed, though extensive, experiences little rainfall in the summer. It drops and warms and loses its oxygen content. Higher flows would mean better habitat for benthic life mayflies, stoneflies in the headwaters, as well as for

Submitter Name/Further Submitter Name	Sub/ F Sub #	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
				 the unique population of large sea-run trout, and the endangered Pomahaka galaxiid which lives nowhere else on earth. Research on the sea-run trout is sketchy at best and could use more study, and the same could be said of the galaxiid. Anthropogenic global warming has made all ecosystems on the dry side of the mountains more fragile. Setting higher minimum flows would seem the prudent thing to do to protect the river, as studies on the impact of climate change on our coldwater ecosystems is sketchy to nonexistent.
Daniel Rietveld	11	Support	Submitter basically supports what ORC have done with 3.6 cumecs as a minimum flow, and doesn't want to lose it, but if we could get a summer minimum flow of 4-5 cumecs would be even better.	 It means a healthier fishery during low summer flows. Places submitter normally finds fish when the river is flowing higher are not there when river is low as the water temperature gets too high for them to live in.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 11 ref. 4		Same position as further submitter.
Alan McIntyre	12	Amend	The 3.6 cumecs for the warmer months proposed are unrealistic. This must be increased to a minimal low flow of circa 6.0 + cumecs for the health of the ecosystem.	 The flow rates proposed are unrealistic and far too low to sustain what lives in this river. These are decisions not fully thought through. The implications for aquatic life and whole ecosystem of this hugely important river to the fishing community are massive. The amount of money thousands of fishermen pay to get to areas of this river each year seems to be an afterthought. The current levels of returning sea trout and brown trout will undoubtedly drop as there will be less food, less oxygen and less sediment removal due to reduced flow rates. The current ecosystem will be greatly affected by what is

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Name/Further	F Sub			
Submitter Name	#			
				proposed.
Otago Fish & Game	22	Support in		Further submitter supports sentiment but does not believe a
Council		part		minimum flow above the 7-day mean annual low flow is
		submission		sustainable.
		12 ref. 4		

5 Schedule 2A, May-Sept minimum flow of 7000 l/s

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Name/Further	F Sub			
Submitter Name	#			
Otago Fish and Game Council	4	Support	Otago Fish and Game submit in support of the winter minimum flow proposal of 7000 litres per second.	The winter minimum flow proposal provides the necessary flows for sea run trout and salmon returning to spawn, the development of eggs, and juvenile recruitment.
Mike Weddell	5	Support	Support a winter minimum flow proposal of 7000 litres per second.	 This provides the necessary flows for sea run trout and salmon returning to spawn, the development of eggs, and juvenile recruitment.
Otago Fish & Game	22	Support		Same position as further submitter.
Council		submission 5 ref. 5		
Conservation, Director General of	9	Support	Retain.	 Inclusion of the specified minimum flows and allocations give effect to Part II RMA, NPS Freshwater and Otago RPS, policy 7(a) and 7(d) of the Conservation General Policy (2005) and to the Southland CMS. The minimum flows give a very high degree of reliability of supply. These minimum flows and allocations will safeguard the life-supporting capacity of the Pomahaka's aquatic resources and sustain the Pomahaka's freshwater fishery values.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 9 ref. 5		Same position as further submitter.

17 All schedule dates

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Name/Further	F Sub			
Submitter Name	#			
Otago Fish and	4	Amend	Replace "October to April" with "1	For completeness.
Game Council			October to 30 April".	
Otago Fish and	4	Amend	Replace "May to September" with "1	For completeness.
Game Council			May to 30 September".	
Conservation,	9	Amend	Clarify all dates so that the allocation	To clarify the dates when the allocation blocks apply.
Director General of			blocks start on the first of the month	
			and end on the last day of the month,	
			i.e. 1 October to 30 April and 1 May	
			to 30 September.	
Otago Fish & Game	22	Support		It is a minor change for consistency.
Council		submission		
		9 ref. 17		
Conservation,	9	Amend	Clarify all dates so that the allocation	To clarify the dates when the allocation blocks apply.
Director General of			blocks start on the first of the month	
			and end on the last day of the month,	
			i.e. 1 October to 30 April and 1 May	
			to 30 September.	

6 Schedule 2A, Primary Allocation Limit

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Name/Further	F Sub			
Submitter Name	#			
Ian Breeze	1	Support	Submitter opposes water abstraction.	Water abstraction allows intensification of agriculture with
				increased greenhouse gas emissions.
Otago Fish & Game	22	Support in		An effective primary allocation limit should be in place, but
Council		part		correctly designed and managed agricultural intensification is
		submission		not opposed.
		1 ref. 6		

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Name/Further	F Sub			
Submitter Name	#			
Otago Fish and	4	Support	Support 1000 litres per second	• Is in accordance with Policy 6.4.2(a).
Game Council			[Pomahaka catchment from confluence with Clutha/Mata-Au to headwaters].	• It will maintain flow variability within the river during summer months.
Mike Weddell	5	Support	Support 1000 litres per second.	This will maintain flow variability within the river during summer months.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 5 ref. 6		Same position as further submitter.
Conservation, Director General of	9	Support	Retain.	 Inclusion of the specified minimum flows and allocations give effect to Part II RMA, NPS Freshwater and Otago RPS, policy 7(a) and 7(d) of the Conservation General Policy (2005) and to the Southland CMS. The minimum flows give a very high degree of reliability of supply. These minimum flows and allocations will safeguard the life-supporting capacity of the Pomahaka's aquatic resources and sustain the Pomahaka's freshwater fishery values.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 9 ref. 6		Same position as further submitter.

7 Schedule 2B, Supplementary minimum flow (first block)

/ Schedule 2D, Suppl	7 Schedule 2D, Supplementary minimum now (mst block)					
Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested		
Name/Further	F Sub					
Submitter Name	#					
Otago Fish and	4	Support	Support 13000 litres per second at	Provides for sufficient flow variability before supplementary		
Game Council			Burkes Ford.	allocation occurs.		
Mike Weddell	5	Support	Support 13000 l/s at Burkes Ford.	Provides for sufficient flow variability before supplementary		
				allocation occurs.		
Otago Fish & Game	22	Support		Same position as further submitter.		

Submitter Name/Further Submitter Name	Sub/ F Sub #	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Council		submission 5 ref. 7		
Federated Farmers NZ (Inc)	7	Did not specify	That the 13,000 l/s supplementary allocation reflects the needs of the community and feedback obtained during the four community workshops.	• As no figure other than 13,000 l/s was discussed or analysed within the Section 32 evaluation report it is difficult for submitter to identify whether this appropriately reflects the community needs and desires.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Neither support nor oppose submission 7 ref. 7		Council's hydrological science work determined 13,000 l/s as appropriate supplementary minimum flow, providing substantial flow variability prior to this flow being reached.
Conservation, Director General of	9	Support	Retain.	 Inclusion of the specified minimum flows and allocations give effect to Part II RMA, NPS Freshwater and Otago RPS, policy 7(a) and 7(d) of the Conservation General Policy (2005) and to the Southland CMS. The minimum flows give a very high degree of reliability of supply. These minimum flows and allocations will safeguard the life-supporting capacity of the Pomahaka's aquatic resources and sustain the Pomahaka's freshwater fishery values.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 9 ref. 7		Council's hydrological science work determined 13,000 l/s as appropriate supplementary minimum flow, providing substantial flow variability prior to this flow being reached.

9 Schedule 2B, Supplementary block size

Ī	Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
	Name/Further	F Sub			
	Submitter Name	#			
	Otago Fish and	4	Support	Submitter provides support for 500 l/s	No reason given.
	Game Council			allocation blocks.	

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Name/Further	F Sub			
Submitter Name	#			
Mike Weddell	5	Support	Submitter provides support for 500 l/s allocation block.	No reason given.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 5 ref. 9		Supplementary block size is consistent with the Water Plan.
Conservation, Director General of	9	Support	Retain.	 Inclusion of the specified minimum flows and allocations give effect to Part II RMA, NPS Freshwater and Otago RPS, policy 7(a) and 7(d) of the Conservation General Policy (2005) and to the Southland CMS. The minimum flows give a very high degree of reliability of supply. These minimum flows and allocations will safeguard the life-supporting capacity of the Pomahaka's aquatic resources and sustain the Pomahaka's freshwater fishery values.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 9 ref. 9		Supplementary block size is consistent with the Water Plan.

10 Schedule 2C, Provision of an alluvial ribbon aquifer

Submitter Name/Further Submitter Name	Sub/ F Sub #	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Conservation, Director General of	9	Support	Retain Schedule 2C where groundwater takes are considered as primary alocation that are also subject to minimum flows as detailed on page 6 of the proposed plan change.	 These minimum flows and allocations and groundwater rules give effect to the Southland CMS. Inclusion into Schedule 2C is particularly appropriate as it manages the effect of stream depleting groundwater, which is required for the sustainable management of shallow groundwater hereby giving effect to Part 2 and S7(g) of the RMA. The schedule rules are required to give effect to and

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Name/Further	F Sub			
Submitter Name	#			
				implement Policy 6.4.1(a).
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 9 ref. 10		Further submitter did not submit originally.
Casey Cravens (Wild Angler)	10	Support	Submitter supports the objective of treating ground water and surface water similarly.	No reason given.

13 Maps B & C

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Name/Further	F Sub			
Submitter Name	#			
Conservation,	9	Support	Retain changes to Maps B11, B13,	Gives effect to the plan change as detailed in other specific
Director General of			and B15, C22 and C23.	provisions.
Otago Fish & Game	22	Support		For further clarity.
Council		submission		
		9 ref. 13		

14 Whole Plan Change

14 Whole I am Change					
Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested	
Name/Further	F Sub				
Submitter Name	#				
Federated Farmers	7	Not	[Give] due regard to the values and	• Submitter's support for Plan Change 3B is dependent on the	
NZ (Inc)		Applicable	uses the community has identified as	workability and reasonableness of the resulting minimum	
			important, and holders of existing	flows and allocation limits.	
			primary allocation status consents	• In complying with the NPSFM and the objectives of the	
			[should] continue to benefit from that	Water Plan, Council must provide for a fair, reasonable	
			status, even where the result is an	management regime for plan users. As part of this process,	
			exceeding of the primary allocation	the values and uses the community has identified as	

Submitter Name/Further Submitter Name	Sub/ F Sub #	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
			limit set by the plan.	important should be provided for in a fair and reasonable manner.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Neither support nor oppose submission 7 ref. 14		The plan change should be reasonable for the community to implement as there has been no history of overallocation in this catchment, with the demand for water only increasing substantially in the last two years.
Adrian McIntyre	8	Support	Submitter supports proposed Plan Change 3B.	The Pomahaka River and its tributary the Waipahi River are a vitally important natural resource and recreational amenity for the West Otago community which contributes significantly to our rural quality of life.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 8 ref. 14		Further submitter supports Plan Change and submitter.
Gordon McManus	13	Support	Submitter wishes to support the proposed minimum flow regime for the Pomahaka River at Burkes Ford. Either approve the plan change as advertised or alternatively consider an increase to the summer minimum flow to 90% of the mean annual low flow given the very high fisheries and amenity values supported by the Pomahaka and Waipahi Rivers.	 The Waipahi and Pomahaka rivers are held in very [high] regard by anglers throughout Otago, New Zealand and overseas. It is important to maintain and enhance the rivers' fisheries values through setting a generous minimum flow with the aim of returning them to peak condition and former glory. In submitter's experience both rivers have been impacted by intensive land use over the periods fished and this trend needs to be reversed.
Kai Tahu ki Otago	14	Not Applicable	Implement the relief sought, make any similar amendments with like effect to the relief sought, and make any consequential amendments necessary to give effect to the relief sought.	No reasons stated.

Submitter Name/Further Submitter Name	Sub/ F Sub #	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 14 ref. 14		Same position as further submitter.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 14 ref. 14		Minor and inconsequential changes.
Otago Anglers' Association	15	Support	Support Proposed Plan Change 3B in respect of summer minimum flow, winter minimum flow, primary allocation limit and supplementary allocation limits and approve the plan change unless ORC's analysis of submissions and river values supports a higher summer minimum flow than 3.6 cumecs in which case support an increased summer minimum.	 The closer the minimum flow is to the natural summer low flow the better it is for river health and fisheries values, particularly in the face of land use intensification. The Pomahaka and Waipahi Rivers support first class trout fisheries despite the adverse effects of land use. The submitter hopes for another hundred years of fly fishing competitions and angler enjoyment of the fishery.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 15 ref. 14		Same position as further submitter.
Mark Barrett	16	Did not specify	Listen to Fish and Game.	Destroying great parts of New Zealand for short term gain must stop. The Pomahaka and all of our rivers are public and should not be violated for the profit of a few. Restoring natural flow to a river is healthy for it and the land and people around it. Destructive practice is permanent and we need to leave a natural clean world for the next generations of kiwis.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 16 ref. 14		Submitter agrees.

18 Minor & consequential

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested			
Name/Further	F Sub						
Submitter Name	#						
Conservation, Director General of	9	Support	Retain minor and consequential changes to give effect to the plan change.	Gives effect to the plan change as detailed in other specific provisions.			
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 9 ref. 18		Minor and inconsequential change.			

15 Section 32 Evaluation Report

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Name/Further	F Sub			
Submitter Name	#			
Federated Farmers NZ (Inc)	7	Not Applicable	Ensure both Options 2 and 3 [of the Section 32 Report] for irrigation-season takes are given full consideration. The resulting management options must reflect the community feedback obtained during the four community workshops. As Option 2 results in constrained economic opportunities, that any indicated environmental benefits to the trout fisheries from taking this approach (over Option 3) are more than insignificant, and are real and measurable. For winter-take options, that Council ensures the needs of the community are addressed and that resulting minimum flows	 It is unclear what additional measurable benefit to the brown trout fisheries will result from Option 2, versus Option 3. For these reasons, submitter considers Option 3 must be given serious consideration. Submitter considers the community must have significant input into what approach best responds to the community needs. The regionally significant trout fisheries need due consideration but, equally, so do the families and businesses reliant on water takes within the catchment.

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Name/Further	F Sub			
Submitter Name	#			
			reflect community feedback.	
Otago Fish & Game	22	Support in		A minimum flow of 3,600 litres per second provides about 99%
Council		part		surety of supply. This is above the industry average of 90%
		submission		surety of supply, and thus meets community needs as well as the
		7 ref. 15		needs of the environment. Further submitter appreciates the
				submitter's recognition of the regionally significant trout
				fishery.

Grouped by Submitter (matters beyond the scope of the plan change)

16 Matters not in Plan Change

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Name/Further	F Sub		•	•
Submitter Name	#			
Otago Fish and Game Council	4	Not Applicable	Amend rule 12.1.4.2(iv) and 12.1.4.3(iv) to state "The conditions of all existing consents will be reviewed by the Otago Regional Council under Sections 128 to 132 of the Act to enable the minimum flows set in Schedule 2A or Schedule 2B to be met, the volume and rate of take to be measured in accordance with Policy 6.4.16 and the taking to be subject to Rule 12.1.4.9, within three years of the Plan becoming operative".	This is necessary to provide some certainty that the existing situation of over-allocation of primary water in the Pomahaka catchment is resolved within a timeframe.
Conservation, Director General of	9	Not Applicable	Include a rule requiring the review of all relevant catchment consents under S128(1)(b) of the RMA within 3 years of the plan change becoming operative under S68(7) RMA, or to like effect.	To ensure that all relevant consents are reviewed within a reasonable timeframe to give effect to the plan change minimum flows and limits under S68(7) RMA.
Otago Fish & Game Council	22	Support submission 9 ref. 16		Further submitter does not believe that this matter is beyond the scope of the plan change, as giving effect to the minimum flows and limits proposed in this plan change relies on a timely review of existing resource consents within the catchment. Section 68(7) of the RMA indicates that a plan may state how the rule will affect the exercise of existing resource consents for activities that contravene the rule, and how existing consent holders will comply with the rule. Note that a "may" in this case does not indicate that the Council must undertake these, but it does provide some scope for the consideration of this

Submitter Name/Further Submitter Name	Sub/ F Sub #	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
				matter raised by the submitter. Therefore, the Council would be unwise to rule the matter out of scope at this point in the process. It needs to be heard by the hearing panel as it is a matter of some consequence. It is also reasonable for the purposes of the effectiveness of the plan change and the implementation of the NPSFM to indicate to consent holders when such a review might take place as they have business decisions to make based on these conditions and any review. The further submitter, like the submitter, would also like certainty that this plan change to establish a minimum flow is effective and won't be overridden by existing consents that remain unreviewed. Submitter has four other community water supply takes in the Pomahaka catchment: Moa Flat Rural Water Supply; Glenkenich Rural Water Supply (two takes) and Tapanui Urban Supply. Each of these supplies is listed in Schedule 1B of the Regional Plan: Water for Otago. The Waipahi Supply is not listed in Schedule 1B. Policy 6.4.8 of the Regional Plan: Water for Otago provides that community supplies listed in Schedule 1B may continue to take water even if the flow in the Pomahaka is below the minimum flow proposed. The Waipahi Rural Stock Water Supply is a community supply, providing water for stock needs within the farming community around Waipahi. Such taking is permitted by the Resource Management Act on a property by property basis; the Waipahi supply merely aggregates and controls the taking of the water.
Clutha District Council	17	Not Applicable	Submitter seeks an amendment to the proposed change to add the Waipahi Rural Water Supply to Schedule 1B of the Regional Plan: Water for Otago.	

Submitter	Sub/	Position	Decision Requested	Reason for Decision Requested
Name/Further	F Sub			
Submitter Name	#			
				As such, the Waipahi Rural Stock Water Supply should be
				protected as a community supply and added to Schedule 1B
				of the Regional Plan: Water for Otago.
Otago Fish & Game	22	Support in		Provided that the rates of take and the overall (expected)
Council		part		annual and seasonal allocation of these community water
		submission		supplies can be supplied by the Clutha District Council or the
		17 ref. 16		operators of the schemes, further submitter supports their
				inclusion into Schedule 1B.