

**SUBMISSION ON AN APPLICATION FOR
RESOURCE CONSENTS FOR PROJECT NEXT
GENERATION**

**BY: JUDY FISHER
RESIDENT CAREY'S BAY**

14 April 2011

Introduction

1. My name is **Judy Fisher**. I am a retired project manager. I moved to Carey's Bay from the UK in 2004. For the first 4 years I lived in Williams Street and then I moved to a larger rural property further up the hill on Coombe Hay Terrace. I came as a visitor in 2002 and was captivated by the Bay, the views, the community, the sheltered micro climate, the quiet apart from the occasional train and the birds.

Noise from the Port from extension of the multipurpose wharf

2. Carey's Bay is an historic fishing community not a Port. The Port is situated over the other side of the hill and you hear the noise from the port as you walk up the footpath from Williams Street, over the crest of the hill, to Lady Thorn Dell on Church Road. I chose not to live in the port as it was too noisy and busy and there were large trucks rumbling through the middle of the main street.
3. Two years ago when I moved further up the hill in the Bay I could hear the banging of containers particularly noticeable in the night. It is worse in the summer when the bedroom windows are open. I am amazed that Port Otago's contour model for noise in Carey's Bay does not show that noise rises up the hill. It is intrusive at the moment at times and the Port acknowledges that with large ships on the new multi-purpose wharf the noise in the bay will increase.
4. I have put double glazing in my house and I am not personally interested in noise mitigation for my property. I just want to be able to sleep at night undisturbed by port noise and to go outside in my garden which is a rural property and not have the constant noise from the port reverberate around the Bay which is a natural amphitheatre.

5. To give an example. I woke early on Tuesday morning this week (12/4/11) at around 4 am and thought it must be a full moon night as it was so bright outside. But no, it wasn't the moon but a bright misty light rising above the hill from the Port and lighting up the landscape. The noise of forklift trucks could clearly be heard moving around the port with the occasional loud bang as a container was dropped to the ground. The noise and light pollution is always worse on a still misty night.
6. We have been told we can ring up and complain at night but what is the point, it does not make any difference and who wants to wake up fully and ring in the middle of the night and make a complaint. I don't like complaining and I don't think I should have to. And this is the noise situation currently. How much worse will this all be when the multipurpose wharf is extended on to the Boiler Point reclamation land which is in full view of most of the west side of Carey's Bay and not buffered to some extent by the hill and trees as the current wharves are.
7. Port Otago Ltd has been granted exemption to normal district plan noise limits from all locations where noise is received, in exchange for a mitigation programme which is stacked strongly in favour of Port Otago. The whole noise complaints system is a toothless tiger. Port Otago I am told, was the first NZ port not to have a noise limit set by the Council. The Port has effectively set its own noise limit which is self policed.
8. When we have been sitting outside in our garden during the afternoon and complaints have been made about noise from dropped containers, the noise has stopped or at least reduced, showing that it is possible, when management is there, to stop people dropping containers when a complaint has been received.

9. Mitigating for noise by soundproofing in no way affects the increased noise on outdoor activities. Port management should be improved with the target to minimize noise at source which should include:

- a) Better management of fork lift and straddle carrier operators by building into their contracts requirements for quiet operation.
- b) Better staff training
- c) No movement of containers at night when the port has no boat at the wharves.
- d) Storage of empty containers away from the port
- e) Investing in more hush technology

10. The Port is a large commercial business wholly owned by the Otago Regional Council and it is expanding into a residential area. The Port has money to pay expensive consultants to back up their arguments. I was interested to hear that Mr Butcher their economic consultant say that he only included financial costs and benefits associated with freight cost savings in his cost benefit analysis when he concluded that the NVP (net present value) of benefits to Port Otago Ltd of deepening the channel would be \$1,210 million. This analysis has completely ignored the environmental and social costs that the Port should consider. They obviously do not think these are important or relevant.

Fisherman's Jetty

11. I am an enthusiastic fisher, in fact after my divorce, I even changed my surname to reflect the enthusiasm for my sport, but I am opposed to the

is too small to visit and use Melbourne as their hub. The upheaval to the environment and to residents from the proposed work will all have been in vain. There needs to be a unified port strategy in New Zealand to prevent this happening.

Who pays?

16. As an Otago Regional Council rate payer I am concerned that the proposed \$100million spend will mean additional rates to be paid to fund this. I have seen nothing in the documentation to say where the funding for this project will be coming from. The reason I ask this because when funding about the new stadium was challenged, the reply was that it should have been challenged during the resource consent process.

Conclusion

17. For the reasons given above, I decline Port Otago Ltd's applications in their entirety on the basis that their effects on the Carey's Bay Community will be more than minor and cannot be adequately avoided, remedied or mitigated. Port Otago Ltd have not been good neighbours with regard to our concerns on noise and light pollution under their existing consents and only the most naive could believe that they will behave any differently in future.
18. However, should the Independent Commissioners grant the applications conditions should apply that limit construction work to working hours with no evening or Sunday construction work.